

THE PHYSICOCHEMICAL AND ANTIOXIDANT PROPERTIES OF  
DOUBLE-BOILED *KELULUT* HONEY

NUR ATIKAH BINTI A RAHMAN

A thesis submitted in  
Fulfillment of the requirement for the award of the  
Degree of Master of Engineering Technology

Faculty of Engineering Technology  
Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia

AUGUST 2019

For my beloved mother, father, family and friends



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to dedicate my deepest gratitude to Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), Faculty of Engineering Technology, Department of Chemical Engineering, for providing the facilities for me to accomplish the Master's Degree. Immense gratitude goes to Ministry of Education of Malaysia for the Research Acculturation Grant Scheme (RAGS) that enabled the completion of this project. The funding given by Research Management Centre (RMC) of UTHM through Geran Penyelidikan Pascasiswazah (GPPS) is greatly acknowledged.

A special acknowledgement and appreciation to my supervisor and co-supervisor, Dr Noor Akhmazillah binti Mohd Fauzi (UTHM) and Prof. Madya Dr. Chua Lee Suan (UTM) for their excellent supervision, guidance, patience and constant support. Their invaluable help of constructive and critical guides, suggestions and recommendations given throughout this research work have led to the success of this project. Special thanks to Encik Shamsul Bahri Ahmad and Puan Fauziah binti Hassan from Kampung Bintang, Peserai, Batu Pahat, Johor and Puan Norlezah binti Baharom from Serdang, Selangor for their guide and sample supplies. I would like to thank Mohamed Redzuan bin Mohamed Zan and all my friends for their help throughout the project.

In addition, I appreciate the valuable contribution of Mr. Mohd Redzuan bin Mohd Nor, Madam Masayu binti Maslam and Madam Aziah binti Abu Samah for their cooperation and assistance in various laboratory tasks and experimental works. Thousands of appreciations also to my postgraduate and undergraduate friends, Muhammad Faiz bin Razali, Tan Kian Meng, Aniq Afifi bin Selamat and Thevagar Dewar a/l Murugan for the useful discussions and suggestions throughout the project.

Lastly, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my beloved parents, family members and friends for their love, moral support, understanding and encouragement during the course of this project.

## ABSTRACT

*Kelulut* honey is a unique Malaysian food that has beneficial components and high potential in many health aspects. In commercial processing plant, honey is usually subjected to thermal treatment, where its quality is compromised due to unstable and thermolabile components. Therefore, double boiling was chosen as it does not exert significant heat, thus minimizes damage done. The quality was determined after treated by double boiling technique at optimized condition. Three different sources of *Kelulut* honey based on the main types of foods consumed by the bees (Coconut, Multifloral and Wild Flowers) were tested. *Kelulut* honey samples were subjected to an optimized condition at 60 °C for 35 minutes. Thermal treatment at the same condition was conducted for comparison purpose. The results showed that double boiling treatment increased the total phenolic content of *Kelulut-C* honey significantly, from  $2430.78 \pm 12.24$  to  $2711.10 \pm 23.00$  mg GAE/100 g. The treatment also significantly increased the brown pigment for both *Kelulut-C* and *Kelulut-W* honey by  $11.11 \pm 0.00\%$  and  $27.27 \pm 0.00\%$ , respectively. Whereas, the pH and moisture content of all samples remain unchanged with no formation of hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) was observed. A preliminary four-week storage study showed that double boiling treatment improves physicochemical properties of *Kelulut* honey as compared to the untreated samples for all three types of *Kelulut* honey tested. Meanwhile, a room temperature (27 °C) condition leads to an improvement of antioxidant properties as compared to cold temperature (4 °C). In conclusion, double boiling treatment has established itself as a good alternative processing method for *Kelulut* honey, hence increasing the possibility to bring forward *Kelulut* honey as a unique source for the application in food and beverages industries.

## ABSTRAK

Madu *Kelulut* merupakan makanan yang unik di Malaysia dengan komponen-komponen berkhasiat dan potensi yang tinggi dalam banyak aspek kesihatan. Di dalam bidang pemprosesan secara komersial, madu selalunya melalui rawatan terma yang menjejaskan kualitinya menerusi komponen yang tidak stabil dan termolabil. Maka, rawatan didihan berganda (*double boiling*) dipilih kerana ia tidak mengeluarkan haba yang signifikan dan mengurangkan kemerosotan kualiti. Kualiti madu akan dikaji dengan menguji kesan rawatan didihan berganda pada kondisi teroptimum ke atas ciri-ciri fizikokimia dan antioksidan untuk tiga sumber (Kelapa, Pelbagai Bunga dan Bunga Liar) madu *Kelulut* yang dinamakan berdasarkan makanan utama lebah tersebut. Sampel madu didedahkan kepada didihan berganda pada kondisi teroptimum (60 °C untuk 35 minit) dengan masa pegangan selama 5 minit (yang diperoleh di awal kajian). Rawatan terma dengan kondisi yang sama turut dijalankan bagi tujuan perbandingan. Hasil menunjukkan bahawa didihan berganda telah meningkatkan kandungan total fenolik madu Kelapa dari  $2430.78 \pm 12.24$  kepada  $2711.10 \pm 23.00$  mg GAE/100 g. Tambahan lagi, rawatan ini juga meningkatkan pigmen perang untuk *Kelulut*-C dan *Kelulut*-W sebanyak  $11.11 \pm 0.00\%$  dan  $27.27 \pm 0.00\%$ . Nilai pH dan kandungan kelembapan semua sampel pula berjaya dikekalkan. Tiada penghasilan hidroksimetilfurfural (HMF) ditemui di dalam madu *Kelulut* yang dirawat. Kajian awal penyimpanan selama empat minggu menunjukkan bahawa didihan berganda menambahbaik ciri-ciri fizikokimia ketiga-tiga jenis madu *Kelulut* berbanding sampel yang tidak dirawat. Manakala, suhu bilik (27 °C) memberi kesan peningkatan ciri-ciri antioksidan berbanding dengan suhu sejuk (4 °C). Kesimpulannya, didihan berganda mampu menjadi sebuah alternatif kepada rawatan terma konvensional dalam pemprosesan madu *Kelulut*. Didihan berganda boleh diketengahkan untuk penggunaan lanjut madu *Kelulut* sebagai sumber unik dalam industri makanan dan minuman.

## CONTENTS

<b>TITLE</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>DECLARATION</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>DEDICATION</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>ABSTRAK</b>	<b>vi</b>
<b>CONTENTS</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>LIST OF APPENDICES</b>	<b>xvii</b>
 <b>CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	 <b>1</b>
1.1 Research Background	1
1.2 Problem Statement	3
1.3 Research Objectives	4
1.4 Research Scopes	4
 <b>CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	 <b>6</b>
2.1 <i>Kelulut</i> Honey	6
2.1.1 Floral sources of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	7
2.1.2 Stingless bee species and nest constructions	9
2.1.3 Characteristics of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	13
2.1.4 Physicochemical properties of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	16
2.1.5 Antioxidant properties of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	19
2.2 Honey processing	19

2.2.1	Conventional thermal processing and its effects on honey	20
2.2.2	Other types of thermal treatment methods on honey processing	24
2.3	Double boiling treatment in honey processing	26
2.3.1	Advantages of double boiling method	28
2.4	Storage of honey	29

### **CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY 31**

3.1	Experimental procedure	31
3.1.1	Collection of <i>Kelulut</i> honey samples from different floral source	31
3.2	Processing of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	32
3.2.1	Double boiling treatment of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	32
3.2.2	Thermal treatments of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	33
3.3	Optimization of treatment condition by using Response Surface Methodology (RSM)	34
3.4	Physicochemical analysis	35
3.4.1	Moisture content, total solid and total soluble solids	35
3.4.2	pH	36
3.4.3	Acidity	36
3.4.4	Reducing sugar content	37
3.4.5	Hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content	37
3.4.6	Color	38
3.5	Antioxidant Properties	38
3.5.1	DPPH Analysis	38
3.5.2	Total Phenolic Content (TPC)	39
3.5.3	Brown Pigment	39
3.6	Storage of honey	39
3.7	Statistical analysis	40

## **CHAPTER 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 41**

4.1 Preliminary study on properties distinction between double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut</i> honey	41
4.2 An optimization of treatment on double-boiled <i>Kelulut</i> honey using Response Surface Methodology (RSM)	47
4.2.1 Effects on physicochemical properties	52
4.2.2 Effects on antioxidant properties	54
4.2.3 Optimization	56
4.3 Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of optimized double-boiled <i>Kelulut</i> honey from three different floral sources	58
4.3.1 Analysis on physicochemical properties	58
4.3.2 Comparison on antioxidant properties	71
4.4 Preliminary study on the changes of physicochemical and nutritional properties of treated <i>Kelulut</i> honey after four-week storage	76

## **CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 86**

5.1 Conclusion	86
5.2 Recommendations for future work	87

## **REFERENCES 89**

## **APPENDICES 106**



## LIST OF FIGURES

2.1	A <i>Kelulut</i> bee farm in Kampung Bintang, Batu Pahat, Johor where the main floral source in this one-acre farm is Coconut tree ( <i>Cocos nucifera</i> )	8
2.2	A <i>Kelulut</i> bee farm in Serdang, Selangor where the main floral source in this 4000 square metres farm is guava and cinnamon	9
2.3	A <i>Kelulut</i> bee farm in Serdang, Selangor where the main floral source in this 4000 square meters farm is wildflowers	9
2.4	Distribution of stingless bee around the world (Nordin <i>et al.</i> , 2018)	11
2.5	The differences in nest constructions: (a) Vertical hexagonal comb of Apis bee (Rayker, 2010), (b) horizontal comb with clusters of resin pot of <i>Kelulut</i> bee	13
2.6	The flow of conventional treatment in honey production. (Fauzi and Akhmazillah, 2014)	21
2.7	Schematic diagram of a double boiler (wikipedia.org/wiki/Bain-marie)	27
2.8	Schematic diagram of double boiler used in laboratory	28
3.1	Schematic diagram of double boiler used	31
3.2	Schematic diagram of thermal treatment in this study	33
4.1	The pH value for double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut</i> honey	42
4.2	Response surface plots showing effects of double boiling treatment temperature (°C) and time (minutes) on (A) pH, (B) moisture content (%), (C) total solids, (D) total soluble solids (°Brix), (E) Brown pigment, (F) Antioxidant activity (%) of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	56
4.3	Desirability plot of optimized conditions of double boiling temperature (°C) and time (minutes)	57
4.4	Total solids of <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> , and <i>Kelulut-W</i> after subjected to double boiling and thermal treatment as compared with untreated.	61

4.5	Total soluble solids of <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey after subjected to double boiling and thermal treatment as compared with untreated.	62
4.6	The pH of <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey after subjected to double boiling and thermal treatment as compared with untreated	63
4.7	The acidity of <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey after subjected to double boiling and thermal treatment as compared with untreated	64
4.8	The samples of untreated (a) <i>Kelulut-C</i> , (b) <i>Kelulut-M</i> and (c) <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey used in this study	66
4.9	Percentage (%) increase in brown pigment of <i>Kelulut-C</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey after subjected to double boiling and thermal treatment	73

## LIST OF TABLES

2.1	Characteristics of both genitalia of <i>Trigona</i> bee (Vijayakumar and Jeyaraaj, 2014)	10
2.2	Species of stingless bees found in Malaysia (Halimatu, 2017)	12
2.3	Different physicochemical characteristics of European bee honey and stingless bee honey	18
2.4	The summary on the effects of conventional thermal treatment on honey quality	22
2.5	Summaries of the effect of alternative thermal processing on attributes of honey	25
2.6	Advantages of double boil method	28
3.1	Time taken for each sample to reach the desired temperature for double-boiling treatment	32
3.2	Time taken for samples to reach the desired temperature for thermal treatment	33
4.1	Moisture content (%) double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut</i> honey at different temperature and treatment time as compared to untreated samples	43
4.2	Total soluble solids (TSS) and total solids of double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut</i> honey at different temperature and treatment time,	45
4.3	Brown pigment (AU <sub>420nm</sub> ) of untreated, thermally-treated and double-boiled <i>Kelulut</i> honey at different treatment temperature and treatment time	46
4.4	Two-factor, three levels full factorial design used for RSM and experimental data of the investigated responses of double boiling treatment according to Statgraphichs Centurion XVII software	49
4.5	Multifactor ANOVA on the effects of independent variables (X <sub>1</sub> : temperature, X <sub>2</sub> : time) on dependent variable responses	50

4.6	Predicted (Pred.) and experimental (Exp.) Values of pH, moisture content, total solids, total soluble solids, brown pigment and antioxidant activity of double-boiled <i>Kelulut</i> honey	51
4.7	Moisture content of untreated, double-boiled and thermally treated of three different sources of <i>Kelulut</i> honey	59
4.8	Colour parameters ( $L^*$ , $a^*$ , $b^*$ ) and Total Colour Different, TCD of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated (60 °C, 35 minutes) <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> , and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey	68
4.9	Total Reducing Sugar (TRS) content of of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey	70
4.10	Brown pigment ( $AU_{420nm}$ ) of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey	72
4.11	Antioxidant activity (%) of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey	74
4.12	Total phenolic content (mg GAE/g) of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated <i>Kelulut-C</i> , <i>Kelulut-M</i> and <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey	76
4.13	Physicochemical properties of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated of <i>Kelulut-C</i> honey after four-week storage at room temperature ( $\pm 27$ °C) and cold temperature ( $\pm 4$ °C)	79
4.14	Physicochemical properties of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated of <i>Kelulut-M</i> honey after four-week storage at room temperature ( $\pm 27$ °C) and cold temperature ( $\pm 4$ °C)	81
4.15	Physicochemical properties of untreated, double-boiled and thermally-treated of <i>Kelulut-W</i> honey after four-week storage at room temperature ( $\pm 27$ °C) and cold temperature ( $\pm 4$ °C)	83
4.16	Percentage increment or decrement of nutritional properties (BPF and antioxidant activity) of stored <i>Kelulut-M</i> as compared to its initial value (before storage) at cold ( $\pm 4$ °C) and room ( $\pm 27$ °C) temperature	85

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AA (%)	-	Antioxidant activity in percentage
Abs	-	Absorbance reading
Abs <sub>control</sub>	-	Absorbance reading of the control
Abs <sub>sample</sub>	-	Absorbance reading of the sample
ANOVA	-	One-way Analysis of Variance
AU	-	Absorbance unit
DPPH	-	2,2-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl
G	-	Gram
HMF	-	Hydroxymethylfurfural
HSD	-	Honestly Significant Difference
L	-	Litre
M	-	Meters
mm	-	Millimeters
Min	-	Minutes
ml	-	Millilitre
nm	-	Nanometer (wavelength)

pH	-	Decadic logarithm of acid dissociation
RSM	-	Response surface methodology
TCD	-	Total color difference
TPC	-	Total phenolic content
TSS	-	Total soluble solids
UV	-	Ultraviolet
UV-Vis	-	Ultraviolet-visible spectroscopy
°C	-	Degree centigrade
<	-	Less than
>	-	Greater than
±	-	Plus minus
%	-	Percentage



PTTA UTHM  
PERPUSTAKAAN TUNKU TUN AMINAH

**LIST OF APPENDICES**

<b>APPENDIX</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
A	Hives of <i>Kelulut</i> Bees and Examples of Products in the Market	110
B	Temperature Profile for Thermal Treatment	111
C	Total Phenolic Content (TPC) Standard Curve	112
D	Example of HMF Results as compared to the Standard	113
E	Example of Statistical Analysis using Minitab version 18 (Minitab Inc., USA)	114
F	Gantt chart	122-123

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 General Introduction

*Kelulut* honey is a unique honey from a stingless bee species from Malaysia. The demand on *Kelulut* honey is on the rise for its proclaimed nutritional values, with a distinct taste, flavor and aroma depending on its floral sources (Singh *et al.*, 2012). Previous studies have shown that physicochemical properties and quality of honey may vary depending on geographical locations (Gulfranz *et al.*, 2011). The relevance of the study has become practical as consumers' interest in quality and benefits of the *Kelulut* honey has increased. Consequently, a more thorough study on the *Kelulut* honey should be conducted regarding all aspect of *Kelulut* honey.

In general, honey is primarily a carbohydrate material with 85% of fructose and glucose and 10% of other complex sugars (Doner, 2000). It is known that these compounds are heat sensitive. The application of conventional thermal treatment in commercial honey processing plants are known to be detrimental to physicochemical and nutritional properties due to the unstable and thermolabile component when heated at more than 60 °C (Akhmazillah, Farid, and Silva, 2013). Previous studies revealed that the qualities of honey such as nutritional value, texture and taste were compromised when it was subjected to thermal treatment (Akhmazillah, Farid, and Silva, 2013; Akhmazillah and Farid, 2015).

For maintaining qualities and properties of honey, there are several methods developed such as ultrasonic (Chong, Chin, and Yusof, 2017), high pressure processing (HPP) (Akhmazilah, Farid, and Silva, 2014) and microwave treatment (Hebbbar, Nandini, Lakshmi, and Subramaniam, 2003; Dranca and Oroian, 2013;



Stanisław Kowalski, 2013). These methods aim to inactivate the spoilage microorganisms and undesirable enzyme presence in the products, without destroying or minimal impairing the sensorial attributes, color, flavor, nutritional values and antioxidant activity (Chaikham, Kemsawasd, and Apichartsrangkoon, 2016). Despite the increasing number of studies on quality of honey as affected by thermal and non-thermal process, there is yet a study on the effect of double boiling treatment on the quality of *Kelulut* honey, specifically harvested from different floral sources. Conventional thermal processing in industries can be detrimental to the quality of *Kelulut* honey. Thus, indirect thermal approach, particularly the double boiling treatment can be used as an alternative to maintain the high quality of *Kelulut* honey. Double boiling treatment is extensively practiced by local beekeepers and honey producers in Malaysia.

Therefore, this work aims to investigate the effectiveness of double boiling in maintaining and/or improving the physicochemical and antioxidant properties of *Kelulut* honey tested. The findings obtained from this work may contribute not only for further studies and investigation on *Kelulut* honey, but also provide a scientific information or proven for *Kelulut* honey producers as well as consumers, which then give an impact on extensive use of *Kelulut* honey in food and beverage industry.



PTTAAUTM  
PERPUSTAKAAN TUNKU TUN AMINAH

## 1.2 Problem Statement

Information is easily obtained in this millennial era. This includes the information on foods that are being consumed. Hence, consumers are now more alert of what they eat and put on or in their body more than it was before.

This also has affected honey industry includes *Kelulut* honey. Consumers nowadays prefer a high quality and non-modified products, whereas beekeepers prefer a simple and cheaper processing techniques to maintain the quality of *Kelulut* honey. This scenario hence increased the interest on double boiling treatment in honey processing. Conventionally, thermal treatment is the most used method used in industry. However, its application may result in deterioration of thermolabile components (Akhmazillah, Farid, and Silva, 2013). Meanwhile, other processing techniques such as high-pressure, microwave and ultrasonic processing are more expensive and the setups are rather difficult.

One of the pioneers in *Kelulut* beekeeping, Mr. Shamsul from Kampung Bintang, Johor has stated that; most of local beekeepers are using double boiling treatment as conventional practice in *Kelulut* processing. This method has been chosen because it is cheaper, easier to conduct and able to slow down the fermentation reaction. Generally, double boiling technique is known to be an alternative processing method for *Kelulut* honey due to its indirect heat application as compared to conventional thermal treatment. However, the effectiveness of this method was not yet proven scientifically.

Besides the processing method, different floral sources fed by the stingless bees may contribute to different chemical contents. By studying the effect of double boiling treatment on the properties (physicochemical and antioxidant) of different floral sources of *Kelulut* honey, it will aid the *Kelulut* honey as a unique source and its diversification in the food and beverages industry, besides gives clear understanding and provides scientific information not only to scientists but also to the beekeepers and consumers.

### 1.3 Research Objectives

This study embarks on four distinct objectives as follows:

1. To investigate the effect of process condition (temperature and time) of double boiling treatment on physicochemical properties and brown pigment of *Kelulut* honey.
2. To determine the optimum experimental conditions of double boiling treatment for *Kelulut* honey processing by using Response Surface Methodology (RSM).
3. To determine the effect of the optimum double boiling condition (60 °C, 35 minutes) on the physicochemical and antioxidant properties of three different sources of *Kelulut* honey.
4. To evaluate a preliminary study on the storage effect on physicochemical and antioxidant properties of three different sources of *Kelulut* honey at room temperature ( $\pm 27$  °C) and cold temperature ( $\pm 4$  °C) after four weeks duration.

### 1.4 Research Scopes

The scope of the study is;

1. For a preliminary study, *Kelulut* honey has been treated using double boiling treatment (at 30, 60 and 90 °C for 10, 30 and 60 minutes) and conventional thermal processing (at 30, 60 and 90 °C for 10, 30 and 60 minutes). The pH, moisture content, total solids, total soluble solids and brown pigment after respective treatment were evaluated.
2. The optimum condition for double boiling treatment is assessed using Response Surface Methodology (RSM). Temperature at 30, 45 and 60 °C for 10, 35 and 60 minutes of treatment time were assessed and the optimum condition was further used in the study.
3. Changes in quality after treatment is evaluated based on physicochemical properties (pH, moisture content, total soluble solid (TSS), total solid, reducing sugar, diastase activity, free acidity, colour and hydroxymethylfurfural content (HMF)) and antioxidant properties (DPPH analysis, total phenolic content and brown pigment formation).

4. *Kelulut* honey processed at optimized condition (60 °C for 35 minutes) are tested for its storage effect on physicochemical and nutritional properties during four weeks at room temperature ( $\pm 27$  °C) and cold temperature ( $\pm 4$  °C) respectively.



## CHAPTER 2

### LITERATURE REVIEW

#### 2.1 *Kelulut* Honey

Recognized as the bees from the tribe of Meliponini, stingless bee honey is different from the normal honey bee belonging to the tribe *Apini* with a single genus, *Apis*. Under the tribe *Meliponini*, they are further diverged into five other genera namely *Melipona*, *Trigona*, *Meliponula*, *Dectylurina* and *Lestrimelitta* (Baharuddin *et al.*, 2014). In Malaysia, the stingless bees that can be found are from the genus *Trigona* spp, locally known as *Kelulut* (Baharuddin *et al.*, 2014). The number of known stingless bee species worldwide is estimated to be around 400 to 500 while more than 30 species were found in Malaysia. Malaysian Agricultural Research and Development Institute (MARDI) stated that there are at least 11 out of 15 species of stingless bees have high potential to be domesticated in Malaysia including *Heterotrigona itama*, *Geniotrigona thoracica*, *Tetragonilla atripes* and *Tetrigona peninsularis*. In general, *Kelulut* honey produced by stingless bee is less viscous, darker in color and has strong acidic flavor as compared to other honey (Lye, 2015). Recently, *Kelulut* honey has been attracting beekeepers attentions as well as researchers and public due to their benefits in health (Mail, 2016).

Generally, honey bees produce honey from nectar of flowers, and secretion of living parts of plants (Codex Alimentarius Commission, 2001). *Kelulut* bees are much smaller in size which is about 3 to 5mm, and had a slimmer body that is totally different from the usual yellow and black honeybees (Tan, 2012). This criterion gives benefits in collecting nectar from flowers to the deepest space hence more vitamins and minerals were found. This is in accordance with previous study reported by Norjihada

Izzah *et al.* (2016) that showed a higher phenolic acid and flavonoid content was recorded in *Kelulut* honey as compared to Tualang honey (*Apis dorsata*). Moreover, stingless bee honey is twice as nutritious as ordinary honey (Mail, 2014).

### 2.1.1 Floral sources of *Kelulut* honey

Since the last decades, honey bees (*Apidae, Apini*), bumble bees (*Apidae, Bombini*), and stingless bees (*Apidae, Meliponini*) are proved to apply a system to keep foragers from visiting recently depleted flowers by using repellent scent marks (Núñez, 1967; Giurfa and Núñez, 1992; Giurfa, 1993; Goulson *et al.*, 1998; Jane *et al.*, 1998; Jane *et al.*, 2001; Williams, 1998; Goulson *et al.*, 2001). The same application is important in marking rich food sources (Ferguson and Free, 1979; Cameron, 1981; Schmitt and Bertsch, 1990; Villa and Weiss, 1990; Hrnčir *et al.*, 2004). This thus ensure a more efficient good gathering process by using lesser time on the same non-worthy flowers and more time on searching for high quality flowers (Schmitt and Bertsch, 1990; Martin Giurfa and Núñez, 1992). These researches on stingless bees and their foods have given the hints on importance of floral sources studies.

Silva *et al* (2013) has stated that native bee species (known as indigenous bees), stingless bees or *Meliponini* bees are common visitors in a biome composed by botanical species that adapted to tropical climates. Meanwhile, a study on Brazilian stingless bee honey has proven that the physicochemical properties the honey was affected by its floral sources (Sousa *et al.*, 2016). The affected parameters were color, acidity, sugar profile, ash and proline content in the honeys where no differences were perceived for honeys from the same floral source although it is produced by different bee species. This findings may due to the stingless bees' mechanism on flower constancy that is determines by flower scents; proven by Judith *et al.* (1998). The same study also indicated that stingless bees displayed a distinct preference for a single floral scent (such as flower volatiles or compounds emanating from carcasses), where 78-87% of working bees returning to flowers of same floral scent during foraging. Therefore, this explains the uniqueness of stingless bee honey (which is *Kelulut* honey in this study) on its distinct taste and health benefits depending on the floral sources.

In this study, the types of *Kelulut* honey have been classified into three which are Coconut, Multifloral and Wild Flowers. The first type was collected from a bee farm in Kampung Bintang, Batu Pahat, Johor where the main floral source in this one-



acre farm is Coconut tree (*Cocos nucifera*), thus the reason it is classified as Coconut honey (*Kelulut-C*) (Figure 2.1) It has a sweet smell and a sweet taste with a light brown color. It is the most fluidity if observed through naked eyes. Meanwhile, the other two were collected in an approximately two-acres *Kelulut* bee farm in Serdang, Selangor. Although they are in the same farm, each of them is located two kilometers from the other. The Multifloral (*Kelulut-M*) honey was collected in the farm where guava and cinnamon were mainly planted in the area of 4000 square meters (Figure 2.2). Following the floral source, the taste gives a hint of spice and sour. It is visible that *Kelulut-M* has a darker color with thicker fluidity. Thirdly, Wildflowers honey (*Kelulut-W*) is collected at the sides of the farm where there are mainly wildflowers around the hives (Figure 2.3). It gives a more unique smell and taste as compared to *Kelulut-C* and *Kelulut-M* that gives fruity taste. The honey types are named as such only for the purpose of this study and these are not classified as standardized names for other *Kelulut* honey.



Figure 2.1: A *Kelulut* bee farm in Kampung Bintang, Batu Pahat, Johor where the main floral source in this one-acre farm is Coconut tree (*Cocos nucifera*).



Figure 2.2: A *Kelulut* bee farm in Serdang, Selangor where the main floral source in this 4000 square meters farm is guava and cinnamon.



Figure 2.3: A *Kelulut* bee farm in Serdang, Selangor where the main floral source in this 4000 square meters farm is wildflowers.

### 2.1.2 Stingless bee species and nest constructions

Bees play an important role in the ecosystem as they are said to be the main agent for pollinating many species of native and cultivated plants. Bees are also functioning to ensure the maintenance of genetic variability, productivity and quality of many fruits (Avila *et al.*, 2018). Stingless bees are a group of small to medium-sized bees, approximately 4mm of body length and are smaller compared to the normal honey bees (Hrncir, Jarau, & Barth, 2016). Stingless bees are commonly used as commercial pollinators. These bees are equipped with vestigial stings and are usually found in tropical and subtropical parts of the world. The absence of functional stings which



## REFERENCES

- Ajibola, A., Chamunorwa, J. P., and Erlwanger, K. H. (2012). Nutraceutical values of natural honey and its contribution to human health and wealth. *Nutr Metab*, 9(1), 61. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1743-7075-9-61>
- Ajlouni, S., and Sujirapinyokul, P. (2010). Hydroxymethylfurfuraldehyde and amylase contents in Australian honey. *Food Chem*, 119. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2009.07.057>
- Akhmazillah Fauzi, N., and Mehdi Farid, M. (2016). High Pressure Processed Manuka Honey: Change in Nutritional and Rheological Properties Over 1-Year Storage. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, 00. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.13085>
- Akhmazillah, M. F. N., Farid, M. M., and Silva, F. V. M. (2013). High pressure processing (HPP) of honey for the improvement of nutritional value. *Innovative Food Science and Emerging Technologies*, 20(June), 59–63. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ifset.2013.06.012>
- Al-Diab, D., and Bushra, J. (2015). Effect of storage and thermal treatment on the quality of some local brands of honey from Latakia markets. *Journal of Entomology and Zoology Studies* 2015, 3(3), 328–334.
- Aljadi, A. M., and Yusoff, K. M. (2003). Isolation and identification of phenolic acids in Malaysian honey with antibacterial properties. *Turkish Journal of Medical Sciences*, 33(4), 229–236.
- Almeida-Muradian, L. B., Stramm, K. M., Horita, A., Barth, O. M., Silva de Freitas, A., and Estevinho, L. M. (2013). Comparative study of the physicochemical and palynological characteristics of honey from *Melipona subnitida* and *Apis mellifera*. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 48(8), 1698–

1706.

Alvarez-Suarez, J. M., Tulipani, S., d  az, D., Estevez, Y., Romandini, S., Giampieri, F. Battino, M. (2010). Antioxidant and antimicrobial capacity of several monofloral Cuban honeys and their correlation with color, polyphenol content and other chemical compounds. *Food Chem Toxicol*, 48. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2010.06.021>

Alvarez-Suarez, J. M., Tulipani, S., Romandini, S., Bertoli, E., and Battino, M. (2010). Contribution of honey in nutrition and human health: a review. *Mediterranean Journal of Nutrition and Metabolism*, 3(1), 15–23. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12349-009-0051-6>

Andualem, B. (2014). Physico-Chemical , Microbiological and Antibacterial Properties of *Apis mellipodae* and *Trigona* spp . Honey Against Bacterial Pathogens. *World Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 10(3), 112–120. <https://doi.org/10.5829/idosi.wjas.2014.10.3.1304>

Anupama, D., Bhat, K. K., and Sapna, V. K. (2003). Sensory and physico-chemical properties of commercial samples of honey. *Food Research International*, 36(2), 183–191. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969\(02\)00135-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969(02)00135-7)

Ayala-Zavala, J. F., Wang, S. Y., Wang, C. Y., and Gonz  lez-Aguilar, G. A. (2004). Effect of storage temperatures on antioxidant capacity and aroma compounds in strawberry fruit. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 37(7), 687–695. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2004.03.002>

Baharuddin H., R, J., M.F, J., and Mat Ali, M. S. (2014). *Phylogeny of Malaysian stingless bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae: Meliponini) revealed using partial 16s rrna mitochondrial gene*. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/317012790\\_Molecular\\_phylogeny\\_of\\_Malaysian\\_stingless\\_bee\\_Hymenoptera\\_Apidae\\_Meliponini\\_revealed\\_using\\_partial\\_16s\\_rrna\\_mitochondrial\\_gene](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/317012790_Molecular_phylogeny_of_Malaysian_stingless_bee_Hymenoptera_Apidae_Meliponini_revealed_using_partial_16s_rrna_mitochondrial_gene)

Bartakova, K., Drackva, M., Borkovcova, I., and Vorlova, L. (2011). Impact of microwave heating on hydroxymethylfurfural content in Czech honeys. *Czech J. Food Sci*, 29, 328–336.

Bath, P. K., and Singh, N. (1999). A comparison between *Helianthus annuus* and

Eucalyptus lanceolatus honey. *Food Chemistry*, 67(4), 389–397.

Belay, A., Solomon, W. K., Bultossa, G., Adgaba, N., and Melaku, S. (2015). Botanical origin, colour, granulation, and sensory properties of the Harenn forest honey, Bale, Ethiopia. *Food Chemistry*, 167, 213–219. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.06.080>

Bijlsma, L., Bruijn, L. L. M. De, Martens, E. P., Marinus, J., Bijlsma, L., Bruijn, L. L. M. De, ... Sommeijer, M. J. (2006). Water content of stingless bee honeys ( Apidae , Meliponini ): interspecific variation and comparison with honey of Apis mellifera To cite this version : HAL Id : hal-00892215 Water content of stingless bee honeys ( Apidae , Meliponini ): of Apis mellifera.

Bijlsma, L., de Bruijn, L. L. M., Martens, E. P., and Sommeijer, M. J. (2006). Water content of stingless bee honeys (Apidae, Meliponini): interspecific variation and comparison with honey of Apis mellifera. *Apidologie*, 37(4), 480–486.

Biluca, F. C., Braghini, F., Gonzaga, L. V., Costa, A. C. O., and Fett, R. (2016). Physicochemical profiles, minerals and bioactive compounds of stingless bee honey (Meliponinae). *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 50, 61–69. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2016.05.007>

Biluca, F. C., Della Betta, F., de Oliveira, G. P., Pereira, L. M., Gonzaga, L. V., Costa, A. C. O., and Fett, R. (2014). 5-HMF and carbohydrates content in stingless bee honey by CE before and after thermal treatment. *Food Chemistry*, 159, 244–249. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.03.016>

Bogdanov, S. (2011). As Nutrient and Functional Food. *October*, (October), 1–34.

Bogdanov, S. (2012). Honey as nutrient and functional food. *Proteins*, 1100, 1400–2700.

Bozkurt, H., Göğüş, F., and Eren, S. (1999). Nonenzymic browning reactions in boiled grape juice and its models during storage. *Food Chemistry*, 64(1), 89–93. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-8146\(98\)00081-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-8146(98)00081-8)

Brand-Williams, Cuvelier, M. E., and Berset, C. (1995). Use of a Free Radical Method to Evaluate Antioxidant Activity. *Food Sci. Technol.*, 28, 25–30. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0023-6438\(95\)80008-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0023-6438(95)80008-5)

- Brudzynski, K. (2012). Honey Melanoidins: Emerging Novel Understanding on the Mechanism of Antioxidant and Antibacterial Action of Honey Antioxidant Activity of Honey. *Honey: Current Research and Clinical Applications*, (905), 18–38.
- Burdurlu, H. S., and Karadeniz, F. (2003). Effect of storage on nonenzymatic browning of apple juice concentrates. *Food Chemistry*, 80(1), 91–97.
- Burgress. (2015). What is the difference between double boiling and direct heat from the stove to the pot. Retrieved from <https://www.quora.com/What-is-the-difference-between-double-boiling-and-direct-heat-from-the-stove-to-the-pot>
- Cameron, S. A. (1981). Chemical signals in bumble bee foraging. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 9(4), 257–260.
- Can, Z., Yildiz, O., Sahin, H., Turumtay, E. A., Silici, S., and Kolayli, S. (2015). An investigation of Turkish honeys: their physico-chemical properties, antioxidant capacities and phenolic profiles. *Food Chemistry*, 180, 133–141.
- Castañer, M., Gil, M. I., Ruiz, M. V., and Artés, F. (1999). Browning susceptibility of minimally processed Baby and Romaine lettuces. *European Food Research and Technology*, 209(1), 52–56. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s002170050456>
- Cavia, M. M., Fernández-Muiño, M. A., Gómez-Alonso, E., Montes-Pérez, M. J., Huidobro, J. F., and Sancho, M. T. (2002). Evolution of fructose and glucose in honey over one year: influence of induced granulation. *Food Chemistry*, 78(2), 157–161.
- Cervantes, M. A. R., Novelo-Gonzalez, S. A., and Duch-Sauri, E. (2000). Effect of the temporary thermic treatment of honey on variation of the quality of the same during storage. *Apiacta*, 35, 4.
- Chaikham, P., Kemsawasd, V., and Apichartsrangkoon, A. (2016). Effects of conventional and ultrasound treatments on physicochemical properties and antioxidant capacity of floral honeys from Northern Thailand. *Food Bioscience*, 15, 19–26. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fbio.2016.04.002>
- Chaikham, P., and Prangthip, P. (2015). Alteration of antioxidative properties of longan flower-honey after high pressure, ultra-sonic and thermal processing. *Food Bioscience*, 10, 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fbio.2015.01.002>

- Cherchi, A., Spanedda, L., Tuberoso, C., and Cabras, P. (1994). Solid-phase extraction and high-performance liquid chromatographic determination of organic acids in honey. *Journal of Chromatography A*, 669(1–2), 59–64.
- Chong, K. Y., Chin, N. L., and Yusof, Y. A. (2017). Thermosonication and optimization of stingless bee honey processing. *Food Science and Technology International*, 23(7), 608–622.
- Chris. (2012). Why does food cook differently in a double boiler? Retrieved from <http://cooking.stackexchange.com/questions/21957/why-does-food-cook-differently-in-a-double-boiler>
- Chua, L. S., Abdul-Rahaman, N. L., Sarmidi, M. R., and Aziz, R. (2012). Multi-elemental composition and physical properties of honey samples from Malaysia. *Food Chemistry*, 135(3), 880–887. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2012.05.106>
- Chua, L. S., Adnan, N. A., Abdul-Rahaman, N. L., and Sarmidi, M. R. (2014). Effect of thermal treatment on the biochemical composition of tropical honey samples. *Int. Food Res. J*, 21(2), 773–778.
- Chuttong, B., Chanbang, Y., Sringarm, K., and Burgett, M. (2016). Physicochemical profiles of stingless bee (Apidae: Meliponini) honey from South East Asia (Thailand). *Food Chemistry*, 192, 149–155. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.06.089>
- Codex Alimentarius Commission. (2001). Codex Alimentarius Commission Standards. *Codex Stan 12-1981*, 1–8.
- Cortopassi, M., and Gelli, D. S. (1991). Pollen analysis, physicochemical properties and antibacterial action of Brazilian honeys from Africanized honeybees (*Apis mellifera* L.) And stingless bees. *Apidologie*, 22(1), 61–73.
- Cox, S., Gupta, S., and Abu-Ghannam, N. (2011). Application of response surface methodology to study the influence of hydrothermal processing on phytochemical constituents of the Irish edible brown seaweed *Himanthalia elongate*. *Botanica Marina*, 54(5), 471–480. <https://doi.org/10.1515/BOT.2011.059>
- Das, T. K., Samajdar, T., and Marak, G. (2015). Quality Evaluation of Honey from Stingless Bee (*Trigona* sp) Reared by Garo Tribes in West Garo Hills of

Meghalaya. *Journal of Krishi Vigyan*, 4(1), 91–94. <https://doi.org/10.5958/2349-4433.2015.00069.0>

De Sousa, J. M. B., de Souza, E. L., Marques, G., Benassi, M. De T., Gull??N, B., Pintado, M. M., and Magnani, M. (2016). Sugar profile, physicochemical and sensory aspects of monofloral honeys produced by different stingless bee species in Brazilian semi-arid region. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 65(January), 645–651. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2015.08.058>

Dimins, F., Mikelstone, V., Kuka, P., and Jefremovs, A. N. (2014a). Effect of Different Types of Heat Treatment. In *Foodbalt* (pp. 284–288).

Dimins, F., Mikelstone, V., Kuka, P., and Jefremovs, A. N. (2014b). Effect of Different Types of Heat Treatment on Invertase Activity in Honey. *9th Baltic Conference on Food Science and Technology - Food for Consumer Well-Being: Foodbalt 2014*, 284–288.

Do Nascimento, A. S., Marchini, L. C., de Carvalho, C. A. L., Araújo, D. F. D., de Olinda, R. A., and da Silveira, T. A. (2015). Physical-Chemical Parameters of Honey of Stingless Bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae).

Doğan, M. (2011). Rheological behaviour and physicochemical properties of kefir with honey. *Journal Für Verbraucherschutz Und Lebensmittelsicherheit*, 6(3), 327–332. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00003-010-0643-6>

Doner, L. W. (1977). The sugars of honey—a review. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 28(5), 443–456.

Doner, L. W. (2000). Honey. In *Encyclopedia of Food Sciences and Nutrition* (pp. 3125–3130). Oxford: Academic Press.

Dranca, F., and Oroian, M. (2013). Impact of Microwave Heating on Chemical Properties of Romanian Honeys. *J. Agroaliment. Proc. Technol*, 19, 464–469.

Emmert, A. (2010). Mineral Composition of New Zealand Monofloral, *Honeys*, Lincoln University, Lincoln, New Zealand.

Erejuwa, O. O., S. A. Sulaiman, M. S. Wahab, K. N. S. Sirajudeen, M. S. M. Salleh, and S. Gurtu (2010). Antioxidant protection of Malaysian Tualang honey in pancreas of normal and streptozotocin-induced diabetic rats, *Annales*



*d'Endocrinologie*, 71(4), 291–296.

Erejuwa, O. O., Sulaiman, S. A., and Wahab, M. S. A. (2012). Honey - A Novel Antidiabetic Agent. *Int J Biol Sci*, 8(6), 913–934. <https://doi.org/10.7150/ijbs.3697>

Eswaran, V. K. V. U., Priya, V., and Bhargava, H. R. (2015). A Comparative Study of the Biochemical, Antioxidative and Anti-microbial Activity of Apis and Trigona Honey Collected from Different Geographical Areas of India. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 33(1), 160–167.

Eteraf-Oskouei, T., and Najafi, M. (2013). Traditional and modern uses of natural honey in human diseases: a review. *Iranian Journal of Basic Medical Sciences*, 16(6), 731–742.

Fadzelly, M., Bakar, A., Sanusi, S. B., Izzany, F., Bakar, A., and Cong, O. J. (2017). Physicochemical and Antioxidant Potential of Raw Unprocessed Honey From Malaysian Stingless Bees. *Pakistan Journal of Nutrition*. <https://doi.org/10.3923/pjn.2017.888.894>

Faiz M. R., Mohd Fauzi, N. A., Sulaiman, A., Talip, B. A., & Rahman, A. A. (2019a). Effect of high-pressure processing on prebiotic potential of stingless bee (Kelulut) honey: Tested upon *Lactobacillus acidophilus* and *Lactobacillus brevis*. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, e13946.

Faiz M. R., Fauzi, N. A. M., Sulaiman, A., & Rahman, N. A. A. Effect of high-pressure processing (hpp) on antioxidant, diastase activity and colour for kelulut (stingless bee) honey. *Jurnal Teknologi*, 81(3).

Fauzi, and Akhmazillah, N. (2014). Quality Improvement of Manuka Honey Through the Application of High Pressure Processing. *Auckland, University of Auckland*.

Fauzi, N. A., and Farid, M. M. (2015). High-pressure processing of Manuka honey: brown pigment formation, improvement of antibacterial activity and hydroxymethylfurfural content. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 50(1), 178–185. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijfs.12630>

Fauzi, N. A., Farid, M. M., and Silva, F. V. M. (2014). High-pressure processing of Manuka honey: Improvement of antioxidant activity, preservation of colour and flow behaviour. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*, 7(8), 2299–2307.

- Ferguson, A. W., and Free, J. B. (1979). Production of a forage-marking pheromone by the honeybee. *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 18(2), 128–135.
- Fuenmayor, C. A., A. C. D'íaz-Moreno, C. M. Zuluaga-Dom'inguez, and M. C. Quicaz'an. (2012). Honey of colombian stingless bees: nutritional characteristics and physicochemical quality indicators. *Pot-Honey*, 383–394
- Gairola, A., Tiwari, P., and Tiwari, J. K. (2013). Physico-Chemical Properties of Apis Cerana-Indica F. Honey from Uttarkashi District of Uttarahand, India. *Journal of Global Biosciences*, 2(1), 20–25.
- Galindo, F. G., Toledo, R. T., and Sjöholm, I. (2005). Tissue damage in heated carrot slices. Comparing mild hot water blanching and infrared heating. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 67(4), 381–385. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2004.05.004>
- Gambaro, A., Ares, G., Gimenez, A. N. A., and Pahor, S. (2007). Preference mapping of color of Uruguayan honeys. *Journal of Sensory Studies*, 22(5), 507–519.
- Ghazali, H. M., and Sin, M. K. (1986). Coconut honey: The effect of storage temperature on some of its physico-chemical properties. *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 25(2), 109–112.
- Ghazali, (2009). Morphological characterization study of Malaysian honey-A VPSEM, EDX randomised attempt. *Annual Microscopy*, 9, 93–102.
- Gheldof, N., and Engeseth, N. J. (2002). Antioxidant capacity of honeys from various floral sources based on the determination of oxygen radical absorbance capacity and inhibition of in vitro lipoprotein oxidation in human serum samples. *J Agric Food Chem*, 50. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0114637>
- Giurfa, M. (1993). The repellent scent-mark of the honeybee *Apis mellifera* and its role as communication cue during foraging. *Insectes Sociaux*, 40(1), 59–67.
- Giurfa, M., and Núñez, J. A. (1992). Honeybees mark with scent and reject recently visited flowers. *Oecologia*, 89(1), 113–117.
- González-Miret, M. L., Terrab, A., Hernanz, D., Fernández-Recamales, M. Á., and Heredia, F. J. (2005). Multivariate Correlation between Color and Mineral Composition of Honeys and by Their Botanical Origin. *Journal of Agricultural*



and Food Chemistry, 53(7), 2574–2580. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf048207p>

Goulson, D., Chapman, J. W., and Hughes, W. O. H. (2001). Discrimination of unrewarding flowers by bees; direct detection of rewards and use of repellent scent marks. *Journal of Insect Behavior*, 14(5), 669–678.

Goulson, D., Hawson, S. A., and Stout, J. C. (1998). Foraging bumblebees avoid flowers already visited by conspecifics or by other bumblebee species. *Animal Behaviour*, 55(1), 199–206.

Guerrini, A., Bruni, R., Maietti, S., Poli, F., Rossi, D., Paganetto, G., ... Sacchetti, G. (2009). Ecuadorian stingless bee (Meliponinae) honey: A chemical and functional profile of an ancient health product. *Food Chemistry*, 114(4), 1413–1420.

Gulfraz, M., Iftikhar, F., Imran, M., Zeenat, A., Asif, S., and Shah, I. (2011). Compositional analysis and antimicrobial activity of various honey types of Pakistan. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 46(2), 263–267.

Halimatu, E. S. (2017). Preliminary study on double boiling method of *Kelulut* honey: Alteration of physicochemical properties and antioxidant activity. Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia: Bachelor's Degree thesis.

Hebbar, H. U., Nandini, K. E., Lakshmi, M. C., and Subramaniam, R. (2003). Microwave and infrared heat processing of honey and its quality. *Food Science and Technology Research*, 9(1), 49–53.

Hrncir, M., Jarau, S., Zucchi, R., and Barth, F. G. (2004). On the origin and properties of scent marks deposited at the food source by a stingless bee, *Melipona seminigra*. *Apidologie*, 35(1), 3–13.

Hussein, S. Z., Yusoff, K. M., Makpol, S., Anum, Y., and Yusof, M. (2011). Antioxidant Capacities and Total Phenolic Contents Increase with Gamma Irradiation in Two Types of Malaysian Honey, 6378–6395. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules16086378>

Islam, M., Moniruzzaman, M., Mottalib, M., Sulaiman, S. A., Gan, S. H., and Khalil, M. (2012). Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Bangladeshi honeys stored for more than one year. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6882-12-177>

- Joel, N. (2014). Quality Assessment of Nigerian Honeys Sourced from Different Floral Locations. *Journal of Food and Nutrition Sciences*, 2(4), 162. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.jfns.20140204.20>
- Jones, G. S. (2013). Double Boilers. Retrieved from <http://www.reluctantgourmet.com/double-boilers/>
- Judith Slaa, E., Cevaál, A., and Sommeijer, M. J. (1998). Floral constancy in *Trigona* stingless bees foraging on artificial flower patches: a comparative study. *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 37(3), 191–198.
- Karabagias, I. K., Badeka, A., Kontakos, S., Karabournioti, S., and Kontominas, M. G. (2014). Characterisation and classification of Greek pine honeys according to their geographical origin based on volatiles, physicochemical parameters and chemometrics. *Food Chemistry*, 146, 548–557.
- Kędzierska-Matysek, M., Florek, M., Wolanciuk, A., Skąlecki, P., and Litwińczuk, A. (2016). Characterisation of viscosity, colour, 5-hydroxymethylfurfural content and diastase activity in raw rape honey (*Brassica napus*) at different temperatures. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 53(4), 2092–2098.
- Kek, S. P., Chin, N. L., Yusof, Y. A., Tan, S. W., and Chua, L. S. (2017). Classification of entomological origin of honey based on its physicochemical and antioxidant properties. *International Journal of Food Properties*, 0(0), 10942912.2017.1359185. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10942912.2017.1359185>
- Kek, S. P., Yusof, Y. A., Tan, S. W., and Chua, L. S. (2014). Total Phenolic Contents and Colour Intensity of Malaysian Honeys from the *Apis* spp. And *Trigona* spp. Bees. *Agriculture and Agricultural Science Procedia*, 2, 150–155. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aaspro.2014.11.022>
- Keng, C. B., Haron, H., Talib, R. A., and Subramaniam, P. (2017). Physical Properties, Antioxidant Content and Anti-Oxidative Activities of Malaysian Stingless *Kelulut* (*Trigona* spp.) Honey. *Journal of Agricultural Science*, 9(13), 32.
- Khalil, M. I., Moniruzzaman, M., Boukraâ, L., Benhanifia, M., Islam, M. A., Islam, M. N., ... Gan, S. H. (2012). Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of algerian honey. *Molecules*, 17(9), 11199–11215. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules170911199>

- Khalil, M. I., Moniruzzaman, M., Boukraâ, L., Benhanifia, M., Islam, M. A., Islam, M. N., ... Gan, S. H. (2012). Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Algerian honey. *Molecules*, 17. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules170911199>
- Khalil, M. L., and Sulaiman, S. A. (2010). The Potential Role of Honey and Its Polyphenols in Preventing Heart Diseases: A Review. *African Journal of Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicines*, 7(4), 315–321.
- Kim, Y. W. (2011). Cooking Method using an Automatic Pressure Double Boiler.
- Kowalski, S. (2013). Changes of antioxidant activity and formation of 5-hydroxymethylfurfural in honey during thermal and microwave processing. *Food Chemistry*, 141(2), 1378–1382.
- Kowalski, S., Lukaszewicz, M., Bednars, S., and Panus, M. (2012). Diastase Number Changes During Thermal and Microwave Processing of Honey. *Czech Journal of Food Sciences*, 30(1), 21–26.
- Lazarević, K. B., Andrić, F., Trifković, J., Tešić, Ž., and Milojković-Opšenica, D. (2012). Characterisation of Serbian unifloral honeys according to their physicochemical parameters. *Food Chemistry*, 132(4), 2060–2064. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.12.048>
- Liza A-Rahaman, N., Suan Chua, L., Roji Sarmidi, M., and Aziz, R. (2013). Physicochemical and radical scavenging activities of honey samples from Malaysia. *Agricultural Sciences*, 04(05), 46–51. <https://doi.org/10.4236/as.2013.45B009>
- Lorenz, K., and Decareau, R. V. (1976). Microwave heating of foods - changes in nutrient and chemical composition. *C R C Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 7(4), 339–370. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10408397609527213>
- Lye, P. Y. (2015). *Interactive Effect of Trigona Honey and Ampicillin on Staphylococcus Aureus Isolates of Infected Wound*. Universiti Tunku Abdul Rahman.
- Mail, R. (2014). Stingless bee honey - the Mother Medicine. Retrieved April 17, 2018, from <http://www.theborneopost.com/2014/08/31/stingless-bee-honey-the-mother-medicine/>

- Mail, R. (2016). *Kelulut* honey - a health elixir from stingless bees. Retrieved from <http://www.theborneopost.com/2016/08/07/Kelulut-honey-a-health-elixir-from-stingless-bees/>
- Manzocco, L., Calligaris, S., Mastrocola, D., Nicoli, M. C., and Lerici, C. R. (2000). Review of non-enzymatic browning and antioxidant capacity in processed foods. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, 11(9), 340–346.
- Mardi. (2017). Makmal Pemprosesan Madu *Kelulut* Kemaman. Retrieved May 30, 2018, from [http://mardisplash.mardi.gov.my/article\\_read.php?A=201](http://mardisplash.mardi.gov.my/article_read.php?A=201)
- Marszałek, K., Woźniak, Ł., Kruszewski, B., and Skąpska, S. (2017). The effect of high pressure techniques on the stability of anthocyanins in fruit and vegetables. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 18(2), 277.
- Mohamed, M., and Eissa, A. (2012). Pulsed Electric Fields for Food Processing Technology. *Structure and Function of Food Engineering*, 32. <https://doi.org/10.5772/1615>
- Mohamed, M., Sirajudeen, K., Swamy, M., Yaacob, N. S., and Sulaiman, S. A. (2010). Studies on the antioxidant properties of Tualang honey of Malaysia. *Afr J Tradit Complement Altern Med*, 7.
- Moliné, P., Fernández, N. J., Medici, S. K., Fasce, D., and Gende, L. B. (2015). Effect of microwave treatment on microbial contamination of honeys and on their physicochemical and thermal properties. *Polish Journal of Food and Nutrition Sciences*, 65(2), 119–126.
- Moniruzzaman, M., Khalil, M. I., Sulaiman, S. A., and Gan, S. H. (2013). Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Malaysian honeys produced by *Apis cerana*, *Apis dorsata* and *Apis mellifera*. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6882-13-43>
- Moniruzzaman, M., Sulaiman, S. A., Khalil, M. I., and Gan, S. H. (2013). Evaluation of physicochemical and antioxidant properties of sourwood and other Malaysian honeys: a comparison with manuka honey. *Chemistry Central Journal*, 7(1), 138. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1752-153X-7-138>
- Monitoring, A. (2013). *Farm Monitoring Report 2013*.

- Moo-huchin, V. M., González-aguilar, G. A., Lira-maas, J. D., Pérez-pacheco, E., and Mérida, I. T. De. (2015). Physicochemical Properties of *Melipona beecheii* Honey of the Yucatan Peninsula. *Journal of Food Research*, 4(5), 25–32. <https://doi.org/10.5539/jfr.v4n5p25>
- Murphy. (2014). Kampung Gombizau, Honey Bee Village of Sabah Borneo. *Mysabah.Com*. Retrieved from <http://www.mysabah.com/wordpress/kampung-gombizau-honey-bee-village-sabah-borneo/>
- Nickerson, B. W. (2015). Honeyed Roots. In *Herbal Homestead Journal* (p. 66). United States of America.
- Norjihada Izzah, I., Abdul Kadir, M. R., Mahmood, N. H., Singh, O. P., Iqbal, N., and Zulkifli, R. M. (2016). Apini and Meliponini foraging activities influence the phenolic content of different types of Malaysian honey. *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 55(2), 137–150. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00218839.2016.1207388>
- Núñez, J. A. (1967). Sammelbienen markieren versiegte Futterquellen durch Duft. *Naturwissenschaften*, 54(12), 322–323.
- Pataca, L. C. M., Neto, W. B., Marcucci, M. C., and Poppi, R. J. (2007). Determination of apparent reducing sugars, moisture and acidity in honey by attenuated total reflectance-Fourier transform infrared spectrometry. *Talanta*, 71(5), 1926–1931. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2006.08.028>
- Pereira, R. N., and Vicente, A. A. (2010). Environmental impact of novel thermal and non-thermal technologies in food processing. *Food Research International*, 43(7), 1936–1943. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2009.09.013>
- Perico, E., Tiuman, T., Lawich, M., and Kruger, R. (2011). Microbiological Evaluation and Honeys from Physicochemical Marketed in the City of Toledo, PR. *Magazine Exact and Natural Sciences*, 365–382.
- Perna, A., Intaglietta, I., Simonetti, A., and Gambacorta, E. (2013). A comparative study on phenolic profile, vitamin C content and antioxidant activity of Italian honeys of different botanical origin. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 48(9), 1899–1908.
- Philips, S. (2000). Double Boiler Method. Retrieved from <https://www.craftybaking.com/howto/double-boiler-method>

- Pimentel-González, D. J., Basilio-Cortes, U. A., Hernández-Fuentes, A. D., Figueira, A. C., Quintero-Lira, A., and Campos-Montiel, R. G. (2017). Effect of Thermal Processing on Antibacterial Activity of Multifloral Honeys. *Journal of Food Process Engineering*, 40(1), e12279. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpe.12279>
- Pimentel-González, D. J., Jiménez-Alvarado, R., Hernández-Fuentes, A. D., Figueira, A. C., Suarez-Vargas, A., and Campos-Montiel, R. G. (2016). Potentiation of bioactive compounds and antioxidant activity in artisanal honeys using specific heat treatments. *Journal of Food Biochemistry*, 40(1), 47–52.
- Prica, N., Živkov-Baloš, M., Jakšić, S., Mihaljev, Ž., Kartalović, B., Babić, J., and Savić, S. (2014). Moisture and Acidity As Indicators of the Quality of Honey Originating From Vojvodina Region. *Arhiv Veterinarske Medicine*, 7(2), 99–109.
- Purbafrani, A., Amirhosein, S., and Hashemi, G. (2014). The Benefits of Honey in Holy Quran. *International Journal of Pediatrics*, 2(9), 67–73. <https://doi.org/10.22038/ijp.2014.3417>
- Ramón-Sierra, J. M., Ruiz-Ruiz, J. C., and de la Luz Ortiz-Vázquez, E. (2015). Electrophoresis characterisation of protein as a method to establish the entomological origin of stingless bee honeys. *Food Chemistry*, 183, 43–48. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.03.015>
- Rauter, A. P., Dias, C., Martins, A., Branco, I., Neng, N. R., Nogueira, J. M., ... Waltho, J. P. (2012). Non-toxic *Salvia sclareoides* Brot. Extracts as a source of functional food ingredients: Phenolic profile, antioxidant activity and prion binding properties. *Food Chemistry*, 132(4), 1930–1935. <https://doi.org/http://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.12.028>
- Rayker, K. (2010). Empty Bee Hive. Retrieved May 6, 2018, from <http://www.rgbstock.com/photo/mzt6moc/Empty+Bee+Hive>
- Rebiai, A., Lanez, T., and Chouikh, A. (2015). Original Research Paper Physicochemical and Biochemical Properties of Honey Bee Products in South Algeria, 16(2), 133–142.
- Reggie. (2012). The Anatomy of a Double Boiler.
- Saha, S. (2015). Honey-The natural sweetener become a promising alternative therapeutic: a review. *South Indian Journal of Biological Sciences*, 1(2), 103–



114.

Samborska, K., and Czelejewska, M. (2014). The influence of thermal treatment and spray drying on the physicochemical properties of polish honeys. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, 38(1), 413–419.

Schmitt, U., and Bertsch, A. (1990). Do foraging bumblebees scent-mark food sources and does it matter? *Oecologia*, 82(1), 137–144.

See, M. A. D., Manila-fajardo, A. C., Jr, A. C. F., and Cervancia, C. R. (2016). Physico-chemical characteristics of Philippine Honey and Their Implications in the Establishment of Standards for Tropical Honeys Physico-Chemical Properties of Philippine Honey and Their Implication in the Establishment of Standard for Tropical Honeys. *Journal of Apiculture*, 26(1), 45–48.

Shaker, E. S., Ghazy, M. A., and Shibamoto, T. (1995). Antioxidative Activity of Volatile Browning Reaction Products and Related Compounds in a Hexanal/Hexanoic Acid System. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 43(4), 1017–1022. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf00052a032>

Silva, T. M. S., dos Santos, F. P., Evangelista-Rodrigues, A., da Silva, E. M. S., da Silva, G. S., de Novais, J. S., ... Camara, C. A. (2013). Phenolic compounds, melissopalynological, physicochemical analysis and antioxidant activity of jandairá (Melipona subnitida) honey. *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 29(1), 10–18. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2012.08.010>

Singh, M., Chourasia, H. R., Agarwal, M., Malhotra, A., Sharma, M., Sharma, D., and Khan, S. (2012). Honey As Complementary Medicine : - a Review. *International Journal of Pharma and Bio Sciences*, 3(2), 12–31. <https://doi.org/i>

Singh, N., and Parminder, K. B. (1998). Relationship between heating and hydroxymethylfurfural formation in different honey types. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 35(2), 154–156.

Singleton, V. L., Orthofer, R., and Lamuela-Raventos, R. M. (1999). Analysis of total phenols and other oxidation substrates and antioxidants by means of Folin-Ciocalteu reagent. *Methods Enzymol*, 299. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0076-6879\(99\)99017-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0076-6879(99)99017-1)

Souza, B. De A., Marchini, L. C., Oda-Souza, M., Carvalho, C. A. L. De, and Alves,

- R. M. De O. (2009). Characterization of honey produced by species of *Melipona* Illiger, 1806 (apidae: meliponini) from the northeast area of Brazil: 1. Physico-chemical characteristics. *Química Nova*, 32(2), 303–308. <https://doi.org/https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0100-40422009000200007>
- Stefan, B. (2009). Harmonised Methods of the International Honey Commission. *International Honey Commission*, (5), 1–63. Retrieved from <http://www.bee-hexagon.net/en/network.htm>
- Stephens, J. M., R. C. Schlothauer, B. D. Morris et al. (2010). Phenolic compounds and methylglyoxal in some New Zealand manuka and kanuka honeys. *Food Chemistry*, 120(1), 78–86.
- Stout, J. C., and Goulson, D. (2001). The use of conspecific and interspecific scent marks by foraging bumblebees and honeybees. *Animal Behaviour*, 62(1), 183–189.
- Stout, J. C., Goulson, D., and Allen, J. A. (1998). Repellent scent-marking of flowers by a guild of foraging bumblebees (*Bombus* spp.). *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 43(4–5), 317–326.
- Surendra, N. S., Bhushanam, M., and Ravikumar, H. (2012). Antimicrobial activity of propolis of *Trigona* sp. And *Apis mellifera* of Karnataka, India. *Prime Journal of Microbiology Research*, 2, 80–85.
- Tan, R. (2012). Stingless Bees are an Eye Opener. Retrieved May 17, 2018, from <http://www.benefits-of-honey.com/stingless-bees.html>
- Turkmen, N., Sari, F., Poyrazoglu, E. S., and Velioglu, Y. S. (2006). Effects of prolonged heating on antioxidant activity and colour of honey. *Food Chemistry*, 95(4), 653–657. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2005.02.004>
- Vaikousi, H., Koutsoumanis, K., and Biliaderis, C. G. (2009). Kinetic modelling of non-enzymatic browning in honey and diluted honey systems subjected to isothermal and dynamic heating protocols. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 95(4), 541–550.
- Vandamme, L., Heyneman, A., Hoeksema, H., Verbelen, J., and Monstrey, S. (2013). Honey in modern wound care: A systematic review. *Burns*, 39(8), 1514–1525. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.burns.2013.06.014>



- Vijayakumar, K., & Jeyaraaj, R. (2014). Taxonomic notes on *Trigona* (Tetragonula) iridipennis Smith (Hymenoptera: Apidae) from India. *Journal of Threatened Taxa*, 6(11), 6480-6484.
- Villa, J. D., and Weiss, M. R. (1990). Observations on the use of visual and olfactory cues by *Trigona* spp foragers. *Apidologie*, 21(6), 541–545.
- Vit, P. (2008). Review: valorization honey of stingless bees (Meliponini). *Brazilian Journal of Pharmaceutical Science*, 50, 20–28.
- Wang, X. H., Gheldof, N., and Engeseth, N. J. (2004). Effect of processing and storage on antioxidant capacity of honey. *Journal of Food Science*, 69(2).
- Williams, C. S. (1998). The identity of the previous visitor influences flower rejection by nectar-collecting bees. *Animal Behaviour*, 56(3), 673–681.
- Workman, D. (2018). Natural honey export by country. Retrieved May 30, 2018, from [www.worldstopexports.com/natural-honey-expoters/](http://www.worldstopexports.com/natural-honey-expoters/)
- Yaacob, M. (2014). Cara Proses Madu *Kelulut* - Pengurangan Air. Retrieved May 30, 2018, from <http://www.kelablebahKelulut.com/2014/10/cara-proses-madu-Kelulut-pengurangan-air.html>
- Zainol, M. I., Mohd Yusoff, K., and Mohd Yusof, M. Y. (2013). Antibacterial activity of selected Malaysian honey. *BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 13(1), 129. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6882-13-129>
- Zakaria, A. (2016, November 14). Kawalan Kualiti Madu *Kelulut*. *Kosmo.Com.My*. Retrieved from [http://ww1.kosmo.com.my/kosmo/content.asp?Y=2016anddt=1114andpub=Kosmoandsec=Variaandpg=va\\_01.htm](http://ww1.kosmo.com.my/kosmo/content.asp?Y=2016anddt=1114andpub=Kosmoandsec=Variaandpg=va_01.htm)
- Zappala, M., Fallico, B., Arena, E., and Verzera, A. (2005). Methods for the determination of HMF in honey: a comparison. *Food Control*, 16(3), 273–277.